Travis County Commissioners Court Agenda Request

Meeting Date: January 7, 2014
Prepared By/Phone Number: Richard Villareal/512-854-4881, Marvin Brice, CPPB/512-854-9765, Purchasing
Elected/Appointed Official/Dept. Head: Cyd Grimes, C.P.M., CPPO
Commissioners Court Sponsor: Judge Biscoe

Agenda Language: Consider and take appropriate action on the three top ranked firms for RFP No. P1309-005-RV, Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR) for the new 416 West 11th Street Office Building and Parking Structure.

- **Purchasing Recommendation and Comments:** Purchasing concurs with department and recommends approval of requested action. This procurement action meets the compliance requirements as outlined by the statutes.

  Subject RFP No. P1309-005-RV closed on December 11, 2013. The Evaluation Committee, supervised by the Purchasing Office and comprised of representatives from the Facilities Management Department (FMD), reviewed and evaluated (scored) the responses.

  Upon receipt of the cost proposals from the five (5) short listed firms, interviews were held on December 16th and 17th. Based on the results of the proposals and the interviews, the five (5) firms have been ranked and the three (3) highest ranked firms are: (1) Flintco Constructive Solutions, (2) JE Dunn Construction and (3) Hensel Phelps. The attached Scoring Matrix shows the results of scoring of the proposal and the interviews.

  Commissioners Court has requested that they interview the three top ranked firms. Purchasing needs direction on the Court's available schedule to conduct these interviews. Time is of the essence, as we have the A/E, PSP, under contract and ready to proceed with the CMAR project.

FACILITIES MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT

Roger A. El Khoury, M.S., P.E., Director

1010 Lavaca St, Suite 400 • P.O. Box 1748, Austin, Texas 78767 • Phone: (512) 854-9661 • Fax: (512) 854-9226

MEMORANDUM

FM# 416-01-14C-3N
File: 703

TO: Cyd Grimes, CPM, CPPO, Purchasing Agent

FROM: Roger A. El Khoury, M.S., P.E., Director

DATE: December 18, 2013

SUBJECT: 416 W. 11th St. Office Building and Parking Structure
Request for Proposals (RFP) #P1309-005-RV
Recommendation for Approval of Construction Manager at Risk Short List

Facilities Management Department recommends Court approval of the ranked short list of three Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR) RFP proposals related to the 416 W. 11th St. Office Building and Parking Structure Project. Upon receipt of the cost proposals from the five short listed firms, interviews were held by the Evaluation Committee with all five firms. Based on the results of the proposals and the interviews, the five firms have been ranked and the three highest ranked firms are being recommended to be interviewed by the Commissioners Court for final selection of the CMAR for the Project. The three short-listed firms, in order of ranking by the Evaluation Committee, are:

1. Flintco Constructive Solutions
2. JE Dunn Construction
3. Hensel Phelps

The attached Scoring Matrix shows the results of scoring of the proposals and the interviews.

On November 26, 2013, the Court approved the short list of five CMAR firms and issuance of the RFP to the five short-listed firms.

Your assistance in obtaining Commissioners Court approval of this short list is appreciated. If you have any questions or need additional information, please call Ken Gaede at extension 49894.

ATTACHMENT:
1) CMAR RFP Scoring Matrix

COPY TO:
Leslie Browder, Executive Manager, PBO
Ken Gaede, AIA, Senior Project Manager, FMD
Jim Barr, AIA, LEED AP, Senior Project Manager, FMD
Rick Avery, AIA, LEED AP, Project Manager, FMD
Tenley Aldredge, Assistant County Attorney, County Attorney's Office
Richard Villareal, Purchasing Agent Assistant, Purchasing Office

RECEIVED
TRAVIS COUNTY
2013 DEC 18 PM 4:43
PURCHASING OFFICE

Evaluator A

Firm	Flintco	JE Dunn	Hensel Phelps	SpawGlass	White
Pre-Construction Services					
Fee for Pre-Construction Services	$ 75,000	$ 135,000	$ 188,402	$ 73,000	$ 87,350
General Conditions Costs					
Admin Rqmts Subtotal	$ 783,780	$ 1,070,272	$ 1,261,667	$ 1,554,357	$ 1,064,660
Construction Temp Facilities Subtotal	$ 224,400	$ 70,440	$ 209,670	$ 396,866	$ 353,923
Grand Total General Conditions	$ 1,008,180	1,140,712	$ 1,471,337	$ 1,951,223	$ 1,418,583
CMAR Fee					
Percentage for CMAR Fee	2.25%	2.95%	3.95%	3.60%	5.40%
Construction Budget	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000
Calculated CMAR Fee	$ 659,250	$ 864,350	$ 1,157,350	$ 1,054,800	$ 1,582,200
Subtotal Fee and Cost	1,742,430	2,140,062	2,817,089	3,079,023	3,088,133
Difference in $ value relative to the Lowest Fee/Cost	-	397,632	1,074,659	1,336,593	1,345,703
Scoring of Proposal (Fees Plus Cost)	60	55	50	45	40
CM/GC Contingency					
Percentage for CM/GC Contingency	2.50%	2.00%	3.00%	3.00%	10.00%
Construction Budget	29,300,000	29,300,000	29,300,000	29,300,000	29,300,000
Calculated CM/GC Contingency	$ 732,500	$ 586,000	$ 879,000	$ 879,000	$ 2,930,000
Difference in $ value relative to the Lowest Contingency	$ 146,500	$ -	$ 293,000	$ 293,000	$ 2,344,000
Total Value of Proposal (Total of bold numbers above)	2,474,930	2,726,062	3,696,089	3,958,023	6,018,133
Difference in $ value relative to the Lowest Fee/Cost	$ -	251,132	1,221,159	1,483,093	3,543,203
Scoring of the Interviews:	38	30	32	34	25
Total Scores:	98	85	82	79	65

Evaluator B

Firm	Flintco	JE Dunn	Hensel Phelps	SpawGlass	White
Pre-Construction Services					
Fee for Pre-Construction Services	$ 75,000	$ 135,000	$ 188,402	$ 73,000	$ 87,350
General Conditions Costs					
Admin Rqmts Subtotal	$ 783,780	$ 1,070,272	$ 1,261,667	$ 1,554,357	$ 1,064,660
Construction Temp Facilities Subtotal	$ 224,400	$ 70,440	$ 209,670	$ 396,866	$ 353,923
Grand Total General Conditions	**$ 1,008,180**	**1,140,712**	**$ 1,471,337**	**$ 1,951,223**	**$ 1,418,583**
CMAR Fee					
Percentage for CMAR Fee	2.25%	2.95%	3.95%	3.60%	5.40%
Construction Budget	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000
Calculated CMAR Fee	**$ 659,250**	**$ 864,350**	**$ 1,157,350**	**$ 1,054,800**	**$ 1,582,200**
Subtotal Fee and Cost	**1,742,430**	**2,140,062**	**2,817,089**	**3,079,023**	**3,088,133**
Difference in $ value relative to the Lowest Fee/Cost	-	**397,632**	**1,074,659**	**1,336,593**	**1,345,703**
Scoring of Proposal (Fees Plus Cost)	**60**	**55**	**50**	**45**	**40**

CM/GC Contingency					
Percentage for CM/GC Contingency	2.50%	2.00%	3.00%	3.00%	10.00%
Construction Budget	29,300,000	29,300,000	29,300,000	29,300,000	29,300,000
Calculated CM/GC Contingency	**$ 732,500**	**$ 586,000**	**$ 879,000**	**$ 879,000**	**$ 2,930,000**
Difference in $ value relative to the Lowest Contingency	**$ 146,500**	**$ -**	**$ 293,000**	**$ 293,000**	**$ 2,344,000**

Total Value of Proposal (Total of bold numbers above)	**2,474,930**	**2,726,062**	**3,696,089**	**3,958,023**	**6,018,133**
Difference in $ value relative to the Lowest Fee/Cost	$ -	**251,132**	**1,221,159**	**1,483,093**	**3,543,203**

Scoring of the Interviews:	**38**	**35**	**37**	**37**	**33**

Total Scores:	**98**	**90**	**87**	**82**	**73**

Evaluator C

Firm	Flintco	JE Dunn	Hensel Phelps	SpawGlass	White
Pre-Construction Services					
Fee for Pre-Construction Services	$ 75,000	$ 135,000	$ 188,402	$ 73,000	$ 87,350
General Conditions Costs					
Admin Rqmts Subtotal	$ 783,780	$ 1,070,272	$ 1,261,667	$ 1,554,357	$ 1,064,660
Construction Temp Facilities Subtotal	$ 224,400	$ 70,440	$ 209,670	$ 396,866	$ 353,923
Grand Total General Conditions	**$ 1,008,180**	**1,140,712**	**$ 1,471,337**	**$ 1,951,223**	**$ 1,418,583**
CMAR Fee					
Percentage for CMAR Fee	2.25%	2.95%	3.95%	3.60%	5.40%
Construction Budget	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000
Calculated CMAR Fee	**$ 659,250**	**$ 864,350**	**$ 1,157,350**	**$ 1,054,800**	**$ 1,582,200**
Subtotal Fee and Cost	**1,742,430**	**2,140,062**	**2,817,089**	**3,079,023**	**3,088,133**
Difference in $ value relative to the Lowest Fee/Cost	**-**	**397,632**	**1,074,659**	**1,336,593**	**1,345,703**
Scoring of Proposal (Fees Plus Cost)	**60**	**55**	**50**	**45**	**40**
CM/GC Contingency					
Percentage for CM/GC Contingency	2.50%	2.00%	3.00%	3.00%	10.00%
Construction Budget	29,300,000	29,300,000	29,300,000	29,300,000	29,300,000
Calculated CM/GC Contingency	**$ 732,500**	**$ 586,000**	**$ 879,000**	**$ 879,000**	**$ 2,930,000**
Difference in $ value relative to the Lowest Contingency	**$ 146,500**	**$ -**	**$ 293,000**	**$ 293,000**	**$ 2,344,000**
Total Value of Proposal (Total of bold numbers above)	**2,474,930**	**2,726,062**	**3,696,089**	**3,958,023**	**6,018,133**
Difference in $ value relative to the Lowest Fee/Cost	$ -	**251,132**	**1,221,159**	**1,483,093**	**3,543,203**
Scoring of the Interviews:	**38**	**35**	**36**	**37**	**30**
Total Scores:	**98**	**90**	**86**	**82**	**70**

Evaluator D

Firm	Flintco	JE Dunn	Hensel Phelps	SpawGlass	White
Pre-Construction Services					
Fee for Pre-Construction Services	$ 75,000	$ 135,000	$ 188,402	$ 73,000	$ 87,350
General Conditions Costs					
Admin Rqmts Subtotal	$ 783,780	$ 1,070,272	$ 1,261,667	$ 1,554,357	$ 1,064,660
Construction Temp Facilities Subtotal	$ 224,400	$ 70,440	$ 209,670	$ 396,866	$ 353,923
Grand Total General Conditions	**$ 1,008,180**	**1,140,712**	**$ 1,471,337**	**$ 1,951,223**	**$ 1,418,583**
CMAR Fee					
Percentage for CMAR Fee	2.25%	2.95%	3.95%	3.60%	5.40%
Construction Budget	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000	$ 29,300,000
Calculated CMAR Fee	**$ 659,250**	**$ 864,350**	**$ 1,157,350**	**$ 1,054,800**	**$ 1,582,200**
Subtotal Fee and Cost	**1,742,430**	**2,140,062**	**2,817,089**	**3,079,023**	**3,088,133**
Difference in $ value relative to the Lowest Fee/Cost	-	**397,632**	**1,074,659**	**1,336,593**	**1,345,703**
Scoring of Proposal (Fees Plus Cost)	**60**	**55**	**50**	**45**	**40**
CM/GC Contingency					
Percentage for CM/GC Contingency	2.50%	2.00%	3.00%	3.00%	10.00%
Construction Budget	29,300,000	29,300,000	29,300,000	29,300,000	29,300,000
Calculated CM/GC Contingency	**$ 732,500**	**$ 586,000**	**$ 879,000**	**$ 879,000**	**$ 2,930,000**
Difference in $ value relative to the Lowest Contingency	**$ 146,500**	**$ -**	**$ 293,000**	**$ 293,000**	**$ 2,344,000**
Total Value of Proposal (Total of bold numbers above)	**2,474,930**	**2,726,062**	**3,696,089**	**3,958,023**	**6,018,133**
Difference in $ value relative to the Lowest Fee/Cost	$ -	**251,132**	**1,221,159**	**1,483,093**	**3,543,203**
Scoring of the Interviews:	**36**	**33**	**35**	**34**	**32**
Total Scores:	**96**	**88**	**85**	**79**	**72**
Total Average Scores:	**97.50**	**88.25**	**85.00**	**80.50**	**70.00**